

**2017 CAMBRIDGE AHRC DTP CONFERENCE: 'Tradition and Transformation'**

**18<sup>th</sup>-20<sup>th</sup> September, Emmanuel College, Cambridge**

**With Australian National University (ANU), a.r.t.e.s. Graduate School for the Humanities Cologne (a.r.t.e.s.),  
European University at St. Petersburg (EUSP), Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT), Stockholm  
University (Stockholm)**

**Panel Session 1a): Investigating Identity through Material Culture**

**Mark Haughton (Cambridge): 'Death as transformation: using the mortuary record to investigate conceptions of gender in the Early Bronze Age of Ireland and Scotland'**

Modern funerals afford the opportunity to reflect on the life of the deceased, and form part of the deceased's transformation from active agent to remembered dead in the minds of the mourners. This holds true for funerals in prehistory, where funerary practice reflects the reincorporation of the deceased in a new role, with redefined or newly emphasised relationships with the living. While the status of the buried person cannot be read directly from the excavated grave, we can investigate how the mourners chose to represent their relationships during this transformation. Where gender forms an important aspect of such relationships, it can thus be investigated in the distant past.

This paper will investigate the gendered construction of funerary transformation set against the dynamic change of the Early Bronze Age in Ireland and Scotland (c. 2200 – 1500 BC). During this period, the established Neolithic understandings of death and personhood were radically rewritten, with the advent of new burial forms in which variation within broad traditions was briefly the norm. Such variation meant that local communities seemingly had greater freedom to make selections in funerary treatment that reflected their relationships with the deceased.

Two Early Bronze Age communities will be considered in detail – one burying their dead at Keenoge, Co. Meath, Ireland, and the other at Dunure Road, South Ayrshire, Scotland. At both sites, people adapted broader traditions to suit the particularities of those they were burying, and thus revealed elements of the social world in which they lived and how they defined themselves in relation to the wider Early Bronze Age world.

**Christine Cave (ANU): 'Tradition and Transformation in early Anglo-Saxon beliefs and burial practices'**

The Anglo-Saxon cemetery on Mill Hill, Deal, Kent was in use for most of the sixth century AD. It sits in a prominent position with views over the sea and the surrounding countryside in the midst of visible remnants of previous occupancies. The cemetery's graves largely focused on a prehistoric ring ditch and barrow, which was situated in the midst of satellite barrows, Iron Age burials, Roman ditches, quarries and graves. The Anglo-Saxons used these ancient monuments to link their society with the power and legitimacy of those who went before them, but their own monuments, including their positioning and placement, emphasise their own traditions and perhaps attempt to resist an impending future as Anglo-Saxon Christians.

A group of eleven burials in the latest phases of the cemetery loudly echoed these early monuments: eight masculine weaponed burials in two rows, their size and spacing suggesting their own barrows, with three feminine burials at their tip. Close analysis of the age, sex and chronology of the cemetery suggests that this group of predominantly male burials were among the last holders of the pagan traditions they brought with them from the Continent. A new cemetery was found within 500 metres of this one, and it is likely that this cemetery was opened to hold newly transformed Christians. Differences in the average ages of females buried in Phase III/IV and Phase IV on Mill Hill hint that the conversion of Anglo-Saxon culture from traditional belief to Christianity may have been led by powerful transformative women. Resistance from still-pagan older women may

have hampered the change, and male conversion lagged slightly; however, the menfolk soon followed their women to lie down in the shepherd's new pastures.

**Sara Morrisset (Cambridge): 'Resistance Through Tradition: Material Culture and Identity in the Ica Valley, Peru'**

Amongst the immense sand dunes of Southern Peru, the hyper-arid environment of the Ica Valley allows for the perfect preservation of an extensive material record that manifests the interplay of tradition and transformation in the 500 years of occupation. The archaeological site of Samaca H-8 within the lower Ica valley was a provincial colonial settlement on the periphery of the succession of distant polities including the Wari, Inca, and Spanish Empires. The iconography and style of the different artistic mediums at the site reflect how the perception of tradition and cultural identity was transformed over time. Indeed, with the fall of the Wari Empire in 1000CE there was a genesis of a new and widely traded art style in the Late Intermediate period. The art style of this period was different from that of the neighbouring valleys and also from the artistic traditions of its antecedents.

In due course, the persistence and revival of this style appears to reflect collective resistance in the Ica Valley. Archaeological research suggests that the traditional Ica art style of the Late Intermediate Period was suppressed during the subsequent rule of the Inca Empire only to be fully revived following the fall of the Inca. During this cultural and artistic renaissance, the people of Ica discarded the vestiges of Inca artistic influence and reinstated the traditional styles established in the previous period. The archaeology of Samaca H-8 exhibits a history in which cultural transformation and innovation involved drawing from traditional art styles of the past. My research examines the rich record of material culture of the Ica valley that provides insight into the dynamic era of the Late Intermediate Period during which the collective identity of the Ica people was formed, transformed by conquest, and reasserted.

**Panel Session 1b): Colonialism and Race**

**Tom Smith (Cambridge): 'Tradition, Transformation, and Sovereignty in the Hawaiian Islands in the Late-Nineteenth and Early-Twentieth Centuries'**

The annexation of Hawai'i to the United States in 1898 marked the culmination of efforts by white, mostly American, planters and businessmen in the islands to erode the sovereignty of the Hawaiian monarchy. In the decades either side of this event, some advocates of annexation were collecting Hawaiian traditions, asserting that they were preserving fragments of indigenous knowledge passed down orally from generation to generation, which were bound to otherwise disappear as 'civilization' wrought rapid transformation across the archipelago. By reading such work on Hawaiian lore in the context of contestations over sovereignty, we begin to understand that even where it purported to be sympathetic to the indigenous population, it rhetorically supported white American rule. In treating indigenous tradition as a curiosity which would be rendered irrelevant and would end up forgotten, American observers implicitly undermined the usage of traditional narratives by Hawaiian monarchs in making their claims to legitimacy against their usurpers. The collection of indigenous traditions moreover speaks to the ambivalence felt by the advocates of annexation regarding the notion of transformation. On the one hand, it was beneficial to celebrate the successes of settler colonialism in the islands in overturning traditional Hawaiian ways of life and making Hawai'i a viable space for American settlement and business. On the other, reminders that the process of transformation was not yet fully complete served both to underline the necessity of U.S. governance and to promote an image of Hawai'i as an island paradise. As such, American writings on Hawaiian tradition appeared to simultaneously offer a platform for the indigenous voice, but also to immediately nullify its relevance. Through such work, we see some of the uncertain cultural foundations upon which American empire in the islands rested.

### **Alexandra Roginski (ANU): 'New Ways with Old Transgressions: Remaking Histories in Postcolonial Australia'**

In the mid-to-late twentieth century, public and academic history in settler– colonial nations such as Australia met with two transformational forces. The first push saw Indigenous activists and progressive historians challenge the dominant narrative of European colonisation as the starting point for a history of national advancement. Concurrently, postcolonial theory emerged within the academic sphere, offering new methodologies for regaining the experiences and perspectives of 'subaltern' groups, and introducing a framework for better understanding structural relationships of power in colonial settings. The transformation did not entirely succeed in Australia, at least in the public sphere, with the contest between old and new approaches to history continuing. Nevertheless, many academic historians today aim to redress the epistemological biases inherent in the traditional historical discipline, which emphasises written sources, usually penned by Europeans. In attempting to reclaim the Indigenous perspective and experience from the record, scholars consult extensively with Indigenous communities, adopt ethnographic methods to study non-verbal action within documentary sources, and draw on oral history, mythology, material artefacts and archaeological evidence. Within this transformed landscape, intercultural historians ultimately work in multiple registers of public, applied and academic scholarship.

The postcolonial practice of repatriation flourishes as one of the most dynamic results of this reconsideration of colonial legacies. Museums and collecting institutions in Australia and around the world routinely respond to the calls of Indigenous activists for the return of Ancestral remains taken during the eighteenth, nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Turning historical study into detective work, this practice harnesses the research skills of those scholars who assist with establishing the provenance of Indigenous remains so that these Ancestors can return home to country and receive respectful burial. Although early claims for repatriation inflamed controversy during the 1970s and 1980s, the practice today stands as the industry norm in museums, and attracts support from all major political parties. This is a radical practice: the past theft is redressed through a return to a community that lives in a changed world, the event accompanied by ceremonies that combine fragments of reclaimed culture with new understandings of what it means to be Indigenous today.

I will examine the resonances of history in the postcolonial practice of repatriation through the case study of my work with the remains of Wonnarua man Jim Crow, who was executed in New South Wales in 1860, collected months later by a phrenologist, donated to Museum Victoria in 1889, identified through my research in 2014, and ultimately reburied in his home country of the Hunter Valley in 2016. The violence of Australia's colonial history reverberates through contemporary relationships between Indigenous and non-Indigenous citizens. As my experiences with Jim Crow will demonstrate, the most potent symbols of this violence – stolen remains – present an extraordinary opportunity to examine the past, and to transform the present.

### **Rose Lenehan (MIT): 'Racial Exploitation and Racial Redress'**

The political philosopher Charles Mills has argued that to properly theorize racial injustice we need to focus on its material legacy—on the ways that labor and wealth have been extracted from subordinate racial groups for White benefit. The term 'racism' is vague and brings to mind, for most people, individual attitudes and beliefs. 'Racial exploitation,' on the other hand, highlights the fact that race has functioned to illicitly disadvantage some and illicitly advantage others. This orientation suggests that ending racial injustice will require ending certain economic relations and redistributing the resources that those relations have wrongfully funneled into White hands.

Mills suggests that racial exploitation is a matter of race determining or significantly modifying an economic transaction or relation: the subordinate racial status of the exploited makes possible what would be morally or legally prohibited for the dominant race. Though I share much of Mills's position, I argue for a different understanding of racial exploitation. Exploitative relations have often been race-making relations. Thus we should think of racial exploitation not as exploitation on the basis of race, but as exploitation that has racially differential effects, serving to create and maintain an economic hierarchy.

## **Panel Session 1c): Design and Creativity in Context**

### **Christianna Bonin (MIT): 'Florals into Airplanes: Textiles and the Making of Soviet Art at the Ivanovo Textile Manufactory, 1928-33'**

If the post-Kantian view of aesthetics in the West, which argues that fine art should be autonomous rather than functional or reproducible, has lost ground among a current generation of art historians, the art world still clings to its inheritance. We remain comfortable distinguishing “art” from “decoration” or “craft,” or valuing the work of “artists” over that of “artisans” in lectures, sales, and exhibitions—even in the face of significant political and epistemological dilemmas produced by these distinctions. This paper examines an earlier challenge to the art/craft divide via the Ivanovo Textile Manufactory in interwar Soviet Russia. The management and practitioners at Ivanovo worked to establish textile production as an “art” rather than a “craft,” in order to dissuade criticism of their work as unimaginative or mechanical and integrate textiles into a larger vision of what Soviet art could be. Because most of Ivanovo’s employees were women, to imagine a fabric pattern as art or a textile maker as an artist was also an attempt to reform the elitist canon of art in Russia to include the work of group’s historically neglected by art’s commentators.

Ivanovo established unusual art studios that included *en plein air* study trips, while also distributing many of its fabrics as authored rather than anonymous. Moreover, many fabric designers studied florals or other natural motifs that dominated pre-revolutionary factory production alongside contemporary photographs of airplanes and tractors. Hence, “modern” Soviet fabrics at that time entailed combining rather than rejecting “traditional” patterns with symbols of modernization. By revealing the visual and linguistic strategies textile makers used to construct their artistic identity, this paper expands the discussion of Soviet art to more fully incorporate the individuals, markets, and media present in the interwar art world.

### **Julia Maxelon (a.r.t.e.s.): “A Piece of Native Soil”: Tradition and Transformation in Modern European Mosque Architecture’**

The construction of purpose-built mosques in Northern, Western and Central Europe started in the late 1950s. Yet, it has only been since the 1990s that they have found their way into the public eye. While they appear in a variety of forms and types, most building owners as well as architects wish for their mosques to be “ein Stück heimatlichen Bodens”, that is “a piece of native soil” or “a piece of home” (as stated by the architect of the Aachen mosque, Rudolf Steinbach, in 1964). How does this translate into architecture?

In contrast to the architects of the 1960s to 1980s who strove to connect the architectural features of classical mosques with modern and postmodern forms, architects have nowadays become more diverse in their approaches. Some mosques feature elements that draw from historicism and orientalism, resulting in unique, hybrid designs. Other mosques seek to transform conventional ideas with an innovative architecture, or are the result of international architectural design competitions. By making themselves visible through their architecture, Muslim communities are demanding their space and role in their respective societies.

Based on these observations, I aim to discuss the architecture of European mosques with regard to notions of ‘home(land)/Heimat’, and link it to ideas of ‘tradition’ and ‘transformation’. The alleged ‘gap between tradition and modernity’ is a catchphrase often used when talking about European mosque architecture. As such, ‘tradition’ and ‘modernity’, as I will suggest in my presentation, serve as notions within the narrative of ‘the Western (architectural) history’ and are thus used as tools to participate in the public sphere.

## **Panel Session 2a): Constructing Conceptual Frameworks**

### **Allison Robbins Koslow (MIT): 'Self-interpretation and conceptual change'**

When philosophers ask a "what is X?" question, they seek an informative analysis of the nature of X, e.g., what it takes for something to be knowledge, a morally right action, an instance of free will, a member of a biological species, the logical function of negation, rape, race or the color red.

The object-level question "what is X?" is equivalent to the meta-level question "what is the reference (or, more generally, the semantic value) of my term 'X'?". It's crucial there be no change in the meaning of "X" in the course of asking and answering the object-level question. So an account of our best methodology can't afford to ignore the question of how representations acquire and change their semantic values.

I suggest the correct semantic assignment for a representation must be justifiable from the epistemic perspective of the subject herself, given suitable empirical information and cognitive powers. If it is not justifiable, then the subject cannot see herself as rationally accepting revelations about the nature of X as an answer to her original question. My account of self-interpretation plays two important theoretical roles: it's both a core constraint on the determination of semantic values (reference) and an epistemological theory about the best method for discovering defining characteristics of familiar topics. The best method of answering "what is X?" questions must get one closer to the truth about X, on an original meaning associated with the token representation 'X' used in posing the question.

On the one hand, an approach like mine provides a more satisfying account of how epistemology and metasemantics are integrated than do epistemicist or reference magnets theories. On the other hand, unlike some prominent 2-dimensional semanticists, I do not take my justifiability constraint to ground a priori conceptual analysis.

### **Steffen Koch (a.r.t.e.s.): 'Conceptual re-engineering in philosophy'**

Conceptual analysis is pre-dominant in 20th and 21st century analytic philosophy. Roughly, the goal of conceptual analyses is to provide answers to 'What is X?' questions by stating the individually necessary and jointly sufficient conditions for X. As such, it is an entirely *descriptive* enterprise. It should not come as a surprise that this enterprise leaves *normative* questions about the concepts we use unanswered. Recently, a number of philosophers working in different fields have started asking questions like 'What should X be?' or 'Does X meet our legitimate purposes?' These normative questions fall in the domain of *conceptual re-engineering*. Conceptual re-engineering aims to improve our conceptual apparatus. Starting from Carnap's writings about what he calls the method of explication, my talk addresses conceptual re-engineering at a very general level: Under what circumstances is it legitimate to engage in conceptual re-engineering? What kind of criteria can be used to measure whether or not re-engineering is successful? Is this method even applicable to standard philosophical areas? I will try to give answers to these questions by engaging in the dispute between Carnap and Strawson. Carnap thinks that analyzing concepts of ordinary language is largely irrelevant for philosophy. What philosophers should do, instead, is to find ways of improving these concepts. Strawson has it the other way around. I will argue that both of these extreme positions are unfounded. Conceptual re-engineering is an important part of philosophy and should receive more attention than it currently does; but it should not be understood as a radical replacement of conceptual analysis. Furthermore, I will make a number of suggestions about how we should conceive of the very activity of conceptual re-engineering and which normative guidelines ought to be followed when we engage in it.

## **Panel Session 2b): The Adaptation of Gender Roles**

### **Sung Un Gang (a.r.t.e.s.): 'Between spectator and spectacle: Transformation of women's spectatorship during the Chosŏn Dynasty (1392-1897)'**

In my presentation I will discuss the transformation process of women's spectatorship during the Chosŏn Dynasty (1392-1897). Borrowed from film studies, the notion of spectatorship can be used to understand how the seemingly *natural* gaze is in fact constructed by and for a hegemonic power structure. I will focus on how the right to watch was granted among different sexes and castes by the state, and what impact these decisions had on the visual culture as well as gender norms of Korea. Analyzing court debates on women spectators at public events, I aim to show how women's bodies in public became a contested place where diverse interests clashed. Furthermore, employing cases of violation against the ban on watching, I explore how women in Chosŏn used the very norm that restricted them to fulfill their desire for spectacles. Through this research, I seek to conceptualize Confucian gender norms from the perspective of intertwined visibility, sexuality, and class.

During the Chosŏn Dynasty, inclusion or exclusion of women as spectators at public events was related to Confucian gender norms and the caste system. While the dogmatic *naeobŏp* (inside-outside-rule) forbade woman's presence out of home in daylight, kings' decisions varied in accordance with their political stances as well as diplomatic relations. Sometimes female spectators were accepted as a subtle sign of the authority of Chosŏn towards China, but sometimes banned as a sign of moral decay. Either way, the state regarded the watching women as objects to be seen rather than seeing subjects.

After the general ban on women's watching across all castes in 1606, women of Chosŏn still went out to see rare spectacles. Noblewomen, who were under the strictest surveillance, appropriated their palanquins as portable auditoriums, whose original purpose was to conceal them. As a result, the noblewomen became invisible yet intrusive eyes. I argue that their public invisibility through 500 years of Confucian rule made them a burning focal point in the early twentieth century, when Korea underwent a series of social transformations under Japanese colonial rule.

### **Amelia Papworth (Cambridge): 'A poem of one's own: Laura Terracina re-writing the *Orlando Furioso*'**

Laura Terracina (1519-c.1577) was sixteenth-century Italy's best-selling female author, renowned for her audacious re-writing of the century's most popular chivalric poem, Ludovico Ariosto's *Orlando Furioso* (1532). Rather than staying true to her canonical source, Terracina draws on the tensions and difficulties of the world which surrounds her to create two new pieces of work: the *Discourse on the start of all the canti of the Orlando Furioso* (first published 1550), and the *Second part of the discourses* (1567). These two poetic works are intimately concerned with questions of gender relations, social equality and religious justice, questioning the moral direction of a world in which women are men's possessions, soldiers slaughtered like cattle, and everyone is a fraud. Initially respectful of Ariosto's words, Terracina becomes increasingly independent through the two texts as she attempts to reconcile her own conscience with the words of a male authority.

Born into a society which valued the importance of tradition above all else, Neapolitan Terracina found herself at the forefront of the print boom, one of the first women to be able to realise the power of the press. She had to tread a delicate line between respect for society's conventions and the inherently disruptive act of a woman daring to take up the pen and to cast her words into the public sphere. Through Terracina, we can see how women of sixteenth-century Italy played with and against tradition in order to tread their own difficult paths.

### **Emily Gallagher (ANU): "'Tea parties in the shade of the mango trees": Doll cultures in Australia between 1910 and 1930'**

For centuries, the enchanting world of dolls has brightened the lives of Australian girls. From paper to celluloid, doll ownership has been an essential ingredient of girlhood (and parenthood). It has also often been interpreted

as an artifact of patriarchal culture, an object that socializes young girls into existing systems of femininity and maternity. The First World War looms large in the history of dolls. After the declaration of war cut off supplies from Germany, one of the largest doll manufacturers of the early twentieth-century, there was an intense wave of doll invention in Australia and abroad. As a result, children's historians have often favored a view of the war as a period of transformation in Australian doll cultures. In this paper, I question the significance of the war in the transformation of doll cultures in Australia. By prioritising the voice of the child, I interrogate the critical distinction between the transformation of the doll industry and the transformation of the gendered roles and responsibilities that were ascribed to dolls. While the war altered the doll market, did the modernisation and commercialisation of the doll industry in this period radically change the values that young girls codified in their dolls?

### **Panel Session 2c): Developments in Religious Thought**

#### **David Runciman (Cambridge): 'Innovative conservatism: Bishops, heresy and apostasy in twelfth-century England'**

From the Church's very beginning, Christian dogma was frequently defined in opposition to competing ideas. The most authoritative texts for medieval Christians – the Bible, and the writings of the Church Fathers – depicted a church constantly assailed by false doctrine; orthodoxy in conflict with and shaped by heresy. Consequently, this rich corpus of authoritative literature could readily be appropriated and reapplied by ecclesiastics of the twelfth century, a period which saw renewed concerns about heresy and apostasy.

In this paper, we shall focus on two English bishops who together devoted their efforts to opposing heresy and apostasy: Bartholomew, bishop of Exeter (1161-84) and Baldwin of Ford, successively bishop of Worcester (1180-84) and archbishop of Canterbury (1184-90). Between them they produced a number of texts written against heresy. Both men looked to the past to deal with the present, compiling authoritative texts of dogma and history, although in quite innovative ways. Yet their underlying conception of heresy, and consequently their approach, was quite different. Bartholomew – the austere pastor – was deeply anxious for his flock and held rigidly to the judgements of the Church Fathers in his polemics against astrology and Judaism. Baldwin – the somewhat otherworldly theologian – took a longer view and was profoundly confident that God used heresy for good, to refine Christians' faith and understanding. While both men wrote in order to defend the dogmas of the church, they unknowingly participated in one of the great ironies of twelfth-century intellectual culture. The very act of compiling the judgements of such revered authorities and arranging them thematically, as so many twelfth-century scholars did, exposed apparent inconsistencies, and so undermined their authority, making it easier to disagree with them or necessary to try to reconcile them.

#### **Federica Ventola (a.r.t.e.s.): 'Durandus of Saint-Pourçain: A philosopher and theologian between *tradition* and *innovation*'**

The most ancient and prevalent Durandus' reputation is the "antithomistic" one. In 1313, the Chapter of Metz indicates the Thomistic doctrine as the official doctrine (the best and the most common) and disapproves the divergent positions. Durandus is accused of being *contra doctrinam communem*. His antithomistic theories are condemned and specified in two lists of mistakes (1314, 1316), because they are judged as dangerous for the doctrinal unity that legitimizes the Dominican intellectual autonomy. According to Joseph Koch, the first scholar who focuses on the problems of Durandus' works, there are three different versions of Durandus' Sentences Commentary: the first, characterized by a strong doctrinal criticism towards Thomas Aquinas; the second, characterized by a retraction of the polemical arguments against Thomas; the third is a return to the critical

position of the first one. A question emerges: is it correct and sufficient to consider Durandus' doctrinal position towards Thomas as a valid criterion to distinguish between the three redactions of the Commentary?

Therefore, it is necessary to understand which sort of antithomism we could talk about. Is Durandus' antithomism so clear and strong or, as Mariateresa Fumagalli writes, «Durandus considers as “not important and defective” the Thomistic arguments which lead to the same conclusion that he approves, but that he proves in a different way»? (Fumagalli, 1969, p. 90). Could his antithomism be exclusively defined in the context of the controversies within the Dominican Order?

A critical study of Durandus' works (in particular of the Sentences Commentary) might allow us to answer these questions. It could confirm that Durandus does not simply criticize a tradition, but **dynamically** places himself between the Thomistic **tradition**, which he never totally leaves, and a certain **innovation**, because he elaborates an original philosophical thought.

### **Hedda Jansson (Stockholm): 'Religion and emancipation. Ellen Key and "secular" Sweden'**

The secular idealism which dawned in Sweden from the Enlightenment and onwards and began to dominate in late 19th century was not without its adversaries. In Sweden women's emancipationists committed to changes in political and educational systems, as well as promoting a turn to an individualistic and modern view on humanity often combined their ideals with deep religious conviction. However, not always in a Christian context.

Several of the leading feminists of late 1800's in Sweden were convinced that society without religion could not be an acceptable solution. Instead, the inclusion of religion would guarantee a more holistic approach in modern society, where materialism and secularization had led to a seemingly reductionist understanding of life, and were considered consequences of patriarchal and Christian dominance. The goal was not to liberate humanity from religion but liberate it to religion, i.e. to any individually chosen spiritual context, as for example the many esoteric movements of the time. However, understanding one's own heritage was also considered essential in the encounter with fellow human beings of other creeds. This meant balancing between tradition and transformation.

Ellen Key (1849 – 1926) was among the foremost advocates of these thoughts, and her statements did not only question her own time, but continued to have a provocative resonance in modern Swedish society through-out the 20th century. In the proposed topic for the conference contribution I would like to explore Key's ideas on religion in connection to theoretical analysis, starting from Max Weber's concept of disenchantment and the discussion of a possible re-enchantment of the world as well as religiosity, or "religioning" as integrated part of the human condition, discussed by among others Christopher Partridge, Linda Woodhead, Nina Kokkinen and Wouter Hanegraaff.

### **Panel Session 3a): Revisiting Classical Texts**

#### **Giulia Marinelli (a.r.t.e.s.): 'Lexicalization and representation of the dynamics between tradition and transformation in Cicero's works: *Consuetudo* and *novitas* in the Late Roman Republic'**

What relevance was accorded to *consuetudo/mos maiorum* as opposed to *novus/res novae* in the late Roman Republic? What attitude did the Romans have towards the transformations - those real and those perceived and feared - that were upsetting Rome? What relationship did the Romans have with their tradition in a time when the *mos maiorum* was in a great crisis? How were the dynamics between tradition and transformation expressed, conceptualized, and perceived?

This study purposes to answer to these questions through a lexical analysis of the semantic sphere of *consuetudo* and *novitas*, to define the vision and the perception of tradition and transformation in the late Roman Republic. It

will use the privileged point of view of Cicero, who, in his writings, provides a rich and efficacious series of examples in this respect. Furthermore, as it will emerge from this analysis, Cicero's vision changes and evolves over his works.

Cicero: the *homo novus* who, despising a new contemporary poetics, named his members *novi*. The orator, politician and lawyer, untiring defender of the tradition, thought as foundation of Rome and its identity. The same tradition that becomes, in Cicero's most conservative phase, a political instrument to legitimize the authority of the *optimates*. Cicero and the *res novae*, often associated, in his speeches, with disorder and political conflict.

Lastly Cicero the man, who in a passage of *Lelius de amicitia* represented transformation as an alternative to tradition, applying this theme to a personal feeling like friendship. From this passage, will be highlighted a distinction between the private sphere and political-institutional sphere, along with a reconstruction of the common Roman perception of the dynamics between tradition and transformation at that historical moment.

### **Lea Niccolai (Cambridge): 'If Socrates never ages: Rethinking the appearance of the philosopher in Late Antiquity'**

This paper addresses the issue of late antique self-definition in relation to the classical past by exploring the appropriation and transformation of the Socratic iconography of the philosopher in the context of the so-called 'third sophistic' (the rhetorical production of late imperial and early Byzantine times).

A short introduction will be dedicated to the notion of the 'ethical vision' of the classical body, with special attention to the role of hair and beard in defining the orthodox appearance of the philosopher in the ancient world. It will be shown how representations of a (Silenus-like) Socrates contributed in establishing an iconographical model that would be absorbed by Greek philosophers and, from Hadrian (76-138 CE) onwards, even by Roman emperors.

In the second part of the paper I set out to analyse the influence exerted by this tradition on the writings of two late antique Greek intellectuals: emperor Julian's *Misopogon* (363 CE) and Synesius' *Praise of Baldness* (403 ca. CE). What I aim to argue is that in both works the self-portrayals of the authors, presented respectively with 'hyper-' and 'hypo-Socratic' features, offer a provocative reinterpretation of the iconography of the philosopher as a vehicle of ideology and as an updated symbol of intellectual prowess. A comparison with the coeval developments of the Christian reflection on the body enables us, in particular, to appreciate (1) the originality of Julian's and Synesius' reassessment of Socrates as ideal, unavoidable model and (2) the complementarity of their responses to the issue of the self-portrayal of the intellectual as a public personality.

### **Panel Session 3b): Perspectives on Education and Society**

#### **Juan Chen (Cambridge): "'Consuming class": Intergenerational mobility, educational choice strategies and the global market of higher education'**

This study focuses on the experiences of education, at home and/or overseas, of three generations within contemporary Chinese middle-class families —including grandparents, parents and students —in order to capture an intimate and 'up-close' picture of the ways in which different generations of contemporary middle-class Chinese understand, conceptualize and respond to increasing pressures to consider and undertake higher education overseas. The three generations broadly span the following eras: Republican China (1911–1949), Maoist China (1949–1976) and the Reform era (1976–present). These three periods witnessed great political, educational and economic transformations. The three (middle-class, urban) cohorts I investigate have been exposed to social forces specific to their generational identity and personal biography, their history of educational experience, and the extent of their own mobility within the Chinese context. Their individual views, opinions and

feelings concerning mobility and overseas education vary, and a comparison of their experiences and views create new knowledge and contribute to the existing literature on international student mobility. It further highlights the pressures associated with global, physical mobility as a practice of class consumption and as an assessment of mobility as it is understood across the generations as it relates in making of social class sense, particularly as the growth of the middle class widens.

My research adopts in-depth qualitative study of Chinese intergenerational social mobility and the growing global market for international qualifications, along with an assessment of underlying motivations and practices that have shaped the drive for mobility within the Chinese middle class. First, in light of the escalating number of Chinese students currently studying abroad, this research raises awareness of the relationship between the changing nature of China as an emerging global market and the resulting impact on the higher education choices of the expanding middle class. Second, my research participants have experienced varying levels of educational opportunity as well as opportunities for social advancement, alongside constraints, and my research illuminates the intergenerational shifts in attitudes towards higher education and the rapidly growing recent trend towards overseas study. In the Chinese context, overseas study is intertwined with tensions associated with class inequality, as the growing accessibility of overseas education for the Chinese middle-class has taken place in parallel with a widening of both educational and social inequality amongst the Chinese population. Third, my research seeks to assess Chinese citizens who are statistically predicted to become members of the widening middle class (regardless of what are often very varied intergenerational class histories within families) but who may doubt whether they are capable of surviving in the highly competitive atmosphere of the New China. Assessing and gaining a comprehensive understanding of Chinese intergenerational struggles for social advancement through education is, therefore, both an important and a timely endeavour.

#### **Farah Ahmed (Cambridge): ‘*Halaqah*: Traditional dialogic pedagogy for British Muslim children in uncertain times’**

This paper reports the findings of an empirical study evaluating *halaqah*, a traditional Islamic oral pedagogy dating back to the Prophet Muhammad, which has been adapted, in order to contribute to developing a sustainable multicultural society in 21<sup>st</sup> century Britain. *Halaqah* is daily practice in two independent British Muslim faith-schools. It aims to develop the agency and hybrid identities of Muslim children through providing a safe space to cumulatively explore challenging issues within an Islamic paradigm. This paper will present the Islamic educational theory that draws on sacred texts to underpin the use of *halaqah* as dialogic pedagogy, and its parallels with mainstream dialogic educational theory. It also reports the findings of a small-scale qualitative study exploring children (aged 10-11 years) and young peoples’ (aged 15-19 years) views on their traditional Islamic beliefs and their contemporary lives, on personal autonomy and being Muslim, and whether *halaqah* has helped them navigate their identity as Muslims living in a secular society. Three hour-long dialogic *halaqah* sessions were held with each group involving a series of key questions to generate dialogue on these topics. The data from these sessions was subjected to both thematic and dialogic analyses, to evaluate children’s and young people’s views, and their capacity to engage in dialogue with each other, and with an imagined secular other. Emergent themes relating to autonomy in their traditional households and secular schools, in childhood and adulthood, independent and critical thinking, navigating authority and peer-pressure, and choosing to be Muslim, are explored. Finally, implications for the contemporary education of Muslim children and young people, and the capacity for cross-cultural, international and social justice applications of *halaqah*, as a critical dialogic pedagogy, will be suggested.

#### **Samuel Blanch (ANU): ‘Spiritual tradition as a “way of life”’**

Tradition is the core analytical stuff of scholarship on Islam. Instead of Weber and Schacht’s comparisons between a singular Western modernity and a traditional Islam, Islam is now analysed as a complex of *traditions* and *modernities* (Asad 1986; MacIntyre 1988).

Cognate approaches – Bourdieu's *habitus*, the *longue durée* analyses of Bellah and Joas (2012), and the Deleuze-inspired map of the Islamic *ecumene* (Salvatore 2016) – share the same basic observation that tradition is a 'meta-institutional force' that '[empowers] social actors... to creatively shape solutions to social problems' (ibid 13). The dynamics of the analytical concept of tradition are bilateral: actors are dialectically or otherwise shaped by traditional knowledges and practices that are themselves historically conditioned. Tradition is a resource (Ajami 1986), a reservoir (Salvatore 2016), a heritage for the use of persons.

My ethnographic work amongst Shia Muslims in Sydney has found a philosophical understanding and practice that does not cohere with the latter understanding of tradition. Philosophers of Islam have long argued that scholars need to treat the *ontological* commitments of Islam more seriously (Jambet 2006; Corbin 1991). My research finds an everyday Shia mysticism where knowledge is not a binary other to the person but is a hierarchical educational practice. My informants seek to climb a ladder of mystical knowledge through storytelling about exemplary religious figures, disciplines of prayer and lamentation, practices of pilgrimage and tithing. This represents an alternative ontology of tradition. Tradition does not inform the person but indexes a person's closeness to God.

My informants practice an intellectual and spiritual 'way of life' (Hadot 1995; De Certeau 1992, 2015). This represents a resistance to modernity's tendency to instrumentalise the world, and an empirical anomaly in sociological observations about increasing 'objectification' of modernity (Eickelman and Piscatori 2004).

### **Panel Session 3c): Challenges to Legal Authority**

#### **Christopher Whittell (Cambridge): '17th century trade tokens and issuers: A challenge to the old order of the English monetary system'**

This paper, using new research, will look at how the problems in supply of short change, that is currency in smaller denominations, led to challenges to the old order and traditions in the monetary system during the 17th century, something that also eventually led to lasting change within it. This paper will first outline the debates around the issue of small change, currency shortages and the issue of the royal prerogative over coinage during the first half of the seventeenth century. It will then present how trade tokens came about in the chaos and power vacuum in the aftermath of the English civil war, when the monarchy was abolished and replaced with a Republic in 1649, which allowed an opportunity to challenge traditions in coinage and government control over it. The paper will subsequently go on to argue how they were accepted for over ten years as a form of currency by the government, at least until 1660 for the first time. It will then show how the government and the king, after the restoration of the monarchy in 1660, fought back against this "challenge" to the old tradition of Royal prerogative over the minting of money and the monetary system, leading to their eventual decision to suppress the token issuers from 1666. Finally, it will go on to argue that although eventually suppressed, trade tokens eventually brought greater awareness amongst many that changes to the traditional monetary system were urgently needed, which the government attempted to undertake with varying degrees of success later in the 17th century. In other words, it will argue that the debates, challenges and innovations resulting from trade tokens had played a part in the beginnings of the modern monetary system of fiat instruments that can be seen today.

#### **Anton Runesson (Stockholm): 'A reformed body in a transformed court: Bodily experiences as legal proofs before the 17th century Mosaic Law'**

The North European legal system underwent two important changes during the 17<sup>th</sup> century: firstly, the transformation of (re)-adopting the old-testament tradition of the Mosaic Law; secondly, the upgrading of personal testimonies at the expense of swearing oaths. How did ordinary people in court cope with these changes as they pleaded their causes?

Following the erosion of ancient authority and the upgrading of individual experience, the 17th century has been designated as constituting a “crisis of consciousness” or “ontological opening” (Steven Shapin), with debates concerning the body, its senses, and their relation to truth. This corresponded to developments within the judicial apparatus, as it became more dependent upon personal testimonies and first-hand experiences, at the expense of the practice of honorable men taking an oath. In especially serious crimes – such as infanticide, bestiality, witch-craft and murder – my research suggests that retelling of bodily experiences became crucial for establishing a person’s credibility.

Departing from the resonance between developments of truth-making within science and law, it should thus prove interesting to bring the perspective of the litigants of courts into these debates, so as to see how their bodily and emotional experiences could guarantee truth. This paper will address how testimonies in court – interpreted as an “epistemological genre” in the vein of Gianna Pomata – about bodily experiences and sensations produced truth in the 17th century Swedish courts. Which bodily experiences and expressions spoke truth – which indicated innocence, and which guilt? What emotions prevented a body from telling the truth? And finally, how was the truthful lived body conceived of?

### **Marie-France Fortin (Cambridge): ‘*The King can do no wrong*: A traditional maxim in need of transformation?’**

*The king can do no wrong* is a legal fiction and capacious expression that is said to be the source of numerous contemporary doctrines of constitutional law. Based on the myth of a feudal God-like king, it is understood to mean that the king – now the Crown – cannot commit a wrong because of the king’s divine-like perfection. Thus, the Crown cannot be sued at common law.

Though such immunity from suit raises issues relating to our contemporary understanding of the rule of law, it has been justified on the basis that its underpinning principle – *the king can do no wrong* – has its roots in the Middle Ages and is deeply ingrained in our legal tradition. The significance of the tradition justifies avoiding any attempt at transforming the common law rule.

However, a legal historical enquiry reveals that *the king can do no wrong* did not originally mean that the king was perfect and unable to commit wrong. On the contrary, the fundamental principle laid out in Bracton’s treatise in the 13<sup>th</sup> century was that the king was under the law. There are numerous occurrences in Bracton’s treatise and cases of the 13 and 14<sup>th</sup> centuries of a wrong being committed by the king, and attributed to him.

Moreover, the first written record of the expression “the king can do no wrong” did not appear until the dawn of the early modern period, in 1483. Such a late appearance of the maxim undermines arguments to the effect that the tradition it embodies emerged in old feudal times.

*The king can do no wrong* understood as a medieval rule which cannot be departed from because of its traditional character is based on a myth. Its transformation – or the reversion to its original meaning – has been long overdue.

### **Panel Session 4a): Conceptions of Time**

#### **Gabriele Passabi (Cambridge): “*Ordiri telam narrationis*”: The chronicle of Sigebert of Gembloux and the rethinking of tradition’**

The dichotomy between tradition and transformation seems at a first sight a preoccupation utterly extraneous to the cultural dialectic of the Middle Ages. Medieval society fits the model of the so-called traditional societies, or, as Claude Levi-Strauss would say, “cold societies”: the founding pillars of medieval society are to be found exclusively in tradition, custom and ritual which project their authoritativeness and their value of truth exclusively in the past, essentially without differentiation.

Resistance to change is emphasised especially in the writing of history whose only canons of legitimacy were the Bible and the classical and late-antique authorities. The genre of universal history is a significant representative of this understanding of history as it had the ambitious goal of providing a chronologically-ordered account of the events since the Creation. Throughout the Middle Ages the writing of universal chronicles was understood as a continuation of the authoritative works of late-antique historians like Eusebius of Caesarea in the fourth century. Medieval historians continued the late-antique universal chronicles with the ambition to provide a historical account of the unfolding of the divine plan.

However, in the eleventh century the chronicler Sigebert of Gembloux (c.1030 – 1112), although he continued the chronicle of Eusebius, he devised a new chronological framework that matched the contemporary European society. This chronological framework was revolutionary in two respects. First visually: he prepared his information in vertical text columns, each representing secular and ecclesiastical categories of government. Second ideologically: the visual scheme was meant to unveil God's plan which saw the prominence of the Holy Roman Empire over the other peoples of Europe. The chronicle of Sigebert is therefore a crucial case study as it shows how Sigebert accommodated innovation as mediation between what seems to us a contradiction between the extremes of tradition and transformation.

### **Crystal Lee (MIT): 'History along a line: Historical timelines and the digital humanities'**

Historians employing digital methods in their archival research have a great intellectual predecessor in Joseph Priestley (1733-1804) and his *Charts of History* and *Biography*, where he employed new material technologies—the timeline—in order to advance historical scholarship and pedagogy. As an intellectual figure of the British Enlightenment, Joseph Priestley is best remembered for revolutionizing experimental chemistry and founding Unitarianism. While much has been written about Joseph Priestley's chemical and theological writings, comparatively little scholarly attention has been given to the historical work for which he was inducted into the Royal Society almost a decade earlier. In this talk, I will argue that the *New Charts of History* (1769) and *Biography* (1765) represented a new historiographical ideal in visual representations of time and space. For Priestley, history needed quantification and standardization in order to become a discipline that could be useful for the development of all fields of human knowledge—an impulse that is echoed widely by many proponents of the digital humanities.

Using Priestley as a starting point, I will show how historical timelines and maps published by historians, chronographers, and geographers relied heavily on cosmological determinations of time and space, and show how researchers using methods in the digital humanities can use Priestley's monographs to problematize and refine their visualizations. In reconstructing the history of Joseph Priestley's timeline, I wish to also touch upon two implications for future research in the history of science: first, that visualization methods (whether they be maps, graphs, or timelines) themselves have a history that is often deeply political and subjective, a point often forgotten by many digital humanists; but second, that historians today might take a cue from Priestley's own concerns about practical development in the humanities in an era where funding for history programs are quickly dwindling.

### **Panel Session 4b): Remodelling Religious Traditions**

#### **Sophie Yvert-Hamon (Stockholm): 'Tradition and transformation through the religious controversies between Catholics and Protestants after the French Wars of Religion'**

With Discourse Analysis as a theoretical and methodological framework, the purpose of this paper is to analyse the place accorded to the *Tradition* as an argument in the religious controversy's discourse after the French Wars of Religion.

The terms *tradition* and *transformation* reflect two confessional perspectives in the way to describe texts and customs accumulated over the centuries since the biblical epoch. The Tradition, invoked by the Catholics, is considered to have a dogmatic value comparable to the Bible. On the contrary, according to the protestant principle of the *sola scriptura*, only the Bible should be taken into account to guide the Christian in his faith. All other texts and customs appear as a *transformation* of the original church, also named *perversion*. The very idea of the Reformation is to find the original *form* of the church.

During the period following the Wars, the opposition between the two religions expresses itself on a more discursive level as attested by the significant increase of religious controversy publications. The corpus for this study is composed of several extracts of the *Traité de l'eucharistie* (1598/1604) by the Protestant Philippe Duplessis-Mornay. The main purpose of the controversist is to convince and, to this end, he has to invoke other authors to achieve authority and credibility. Using different strategies, he also has to be aware of those deployed by his opponents. As a Calvinist (and unlike the Lutherans), Duplessis-Mornay has recourse to his adversaries' weapons, not only using quotations from the Bible but also from several post-biblical authors inclusive contemporary Catholics. Considered for its historical value, the *Tradition* loses its dogmatic value but constitutes a formidable weapon against Catholics.

Analysing the argumentative role of the quotations in the *Traité*, this study focuses on the articulation between biblical and non-biblical quotations as well as on the metadiscourse of the author about using *Tradition* as an argument.

### **Will Ryle-Hodges (Cambridge): 'Islamic reform in late 19th century Egypt: Social virtue and the re-orientation of an ethical tradition'**

Literature on modernization and reform in the modern Middle East tends to convey modernity and tradition as two competing and mutually-exclusive forces – most recently Christopher De Bellaigue's *The Islamic Enlightenment: the modern struggle between faith and reason*. Modernity appears as European, colonial and totalizing in nature, whilst tradition, in the process of reform, appears as objectified, passively uprooted and forced into a Western liberal mould. This paper will focus its attention on the ethical vision and political theology of the influential Muslim reformer, Muhammad Abduh (1849-1905), as reflected in his notion of *ādāb* (etiquette or right conduct), in particular, his treatment of social virtue, and the wider discourses on which he drew. It will seek to evince how his vision of a public sphere and a modern civic life does not negate and displace Islamic intellectual traditions, but operates creatively within their discursive parameters. Supporting, in a broad sense, the theses of social theorists like Charles Taylor and Armando Salvatore who argue for the 'cultural theory of modernity,' it will unpack Abduh's political and ethical discourse on *ādāb* as an instance of a specific cultural and moral vision of modern reform.

### **Andrei Tuikhtiaev (EUSP): 'Tradition and legitimation strategies in New Age Religion (The case of pilgrimage in Southern Russia)'**

Today anthropologists, sociologists and specialists in religious studies observe a growing popularity of various texts and practices involved in specific occult and esoteric area, so called occulture (Asprem, Dyrendal 2015). One of the famous phenomenon in this area is New Age religion, that is characterized by esoteric and mystic ideas and appeals to the tradition as well. In the report I am going to demonstrate how the images and symbols of tradition function in New Age religion, specifically in pilgrimage to the archeological sites, so called power places, in Southern Russia.

The idea of golden age (Bowman 1995) plays a key role in the construction of tradition among New Age followers, implying belief in the ideal human society that existed in a dawn of the human race. The values ascribed to this civilization are perceived as useful material for the projects of ideal future. Wherein the tradition often has ethnic connotations and it is becoming the golden age of Russian nation. However, interpretation of the tradition is not

all-sufficient and its representation requires certain legitimation strategies (Lewis 2010). The most common legitimation strategies are an appeal to the scientific and esoteric knowledge expressed in the industry of alternative history and archeology and the practice of channeling. At the same time images and symbols of the tradition underlie various pilgrims' practices and an appeal to the tradition turns out to be significant legitimation strategy of spiritual experience's authenticity.

#### **Panel Session 4c): Shaping the Urban Environment**

##### **Sascha Klein (a.r.t.e.s.): 'The traditional veil of modernity – Heterotopias of style and space in early Manhattan skyscraper architecture around 1900'**

More than any other architectural structure did the skyscraper come to epitomize modernity and thus humanity's mastery over nature's forces and materials. Indeed, with the combination of a number of technological innovations by the late 19th century, such as steel frame construction and safe elevators, was it possible to build structures of enormous height and to colonize the skies of urban America. Yet while early skyscrapers' construction and functioning were firmly based on a myriad of high-end technologies and infrastructures, that radical modernity was usually hidden behind richly decorated exterior and interior designs that quoted heavily from architectural history. As architect Rem Koolhaas has argued, it seemed necessary to legitimize these outstandingly modern buildings by clothing them in the dress of traditional visual forms. As modern as these buildings were on their inside with their soundproof office spaces as well as vast networks or pipes, ducts, and wires, they often emulated historically established styles on the outside. On this view, for example, New York's Woolworth Building (1913) and Metropolitan Life Tower (1909), both the world's highest buildings upon their completion, outwardly took the form of a Gothic cathedral or a Renaissance campanile, respectively.

With their roots both in the economic will to extract as much profit from an as small as possible ground area as well as in the irrational drive to escape the everyday and to build alternative worlds common to theme parks, these superlative buildings may be regarded as heterotopias, as defined by Foucault. They combine the modern impulses of economic rationalization ("heterotopia of compensation") and of subverting dominant codes and orders ("heterotopia of illusion"). Thus for example, early office skyscrapers housed as many male as female clerks whose behavior was regulated by a strict code of gender separation that was also realized in built space by way of separate elevators, staircases as well as work and leisure spaces. Yet modern office work just as much as the high-rise's complex spatialities also allowed for and sometimes even necessitated contact between men and women and thus helped to subvert these selfsame codes.

This talk will elucidate how traditional and transformative forces shaped, but were also negotiated with regard to the architectural design and spaces of one of modernity's most prominent icons.

##### **Elli Ponomareva (EUSP): 'Narrating the city: Transformation of urban landscape and shifting Armenian identity in Tbilisi'**

In my presentation I will explore how Post-Soviet transformations of the city are narrated by Tbilisi Armenians. A fading minority in the Georgian capital today, the Armenians often reminisce about the city's imperial past. Under the Russian rule in the 19th century the Armenians were the largest ethnic group in Tbilisi. More importantly, wealthy Armenians held prominent positions in the city administration and possessed great economic power. In particular my interlocutors take pride in the Armenian contribution to the formation of the traditional image of Old Tbilisi. Both secular and religious buildings created or owned by Armenians are frequently mentioned.

The importance of symbolic landscape came to the fore with the rapid social and economic changes after the breakup of the Soviet Union. Though the attention of the Armenians had been already attracted to the issue of

landscape transformation when a number of churches owned by the Armenian Apostolic Church before the Soviet period were claimed and reopened by the Georgian Orthodox Church at the end of the 1980s.

While the Armenian narrative on landscape transformation and loss is directed against increasing Georgianisation of the urban space it is not a purely nationalistic claim. Employing the ideas developed by Caroline Humphrey and Vera Skvirskaja I define Tbilisi as a post-cosmopolitan city. It is not simply the loss of buildings but the cultural homogenisation, growing rural-urban migration of Georgians, large-scale emigration of minorities, and the precarious socio-economic state of those who stayed that inform Armenians' narratives on urban transformation. No longer a part of a cosmopolitan multilingual environment the Armenians in Tbilisi increasingly turn to Armenia as a source of value through joining various national organisations. Thus the intricate process of accommodating the old cosmopolitan urban identity to the new diasporic one has begun.

### **Panel Session 5a): The Reception of Literature**

#### **Luisa Moore (ANU): 'New interdisciplinary ways of reading Shakespeare's characters: Defying tradition and foreshadowing transformation in Rossetti's *Hamlet and Ophelia*'**

Nineteenth-century visual representations of Shakespeare's characters offer modern scholars a fascinating window into the nuances of the Victorian reception of his plays, and much valuable work has been done in contextualising these images in terms of such issues as Victorian bardolatry, cultural assumptions about gender, class and race, and contemporary theatrical practices. Scholars have shown somewhat less interest, however, in the interdisciplinary project of exploring the artists' own readings of the characters' implied psychology, and how these readings sometimes entirely transform the traditional Victorian reception of that character. Few, if any, have treated visual artistic representation as a form of psychological literary criticism.

Taking as a case study Dante Gabriel Rossetti's 1858 pen-and-ink drawing *Hamlet and Ophelia*, which portrays the opening of the 'nunnery' scene, this paper seeks to explore how Rossetti transformed the sentimental Victorian perception of Hamlet, stemming from Goethe, Coleridge and Hazlitt, into something darker and more disturbing. Transgressive in orientation, this reading anticipated the apparently innovative written criticism of Hamlet's character spearheaded by Wilson Knight in the 1930s. Further, this paper will investigate whether the non-verbal, non-explicit mode of interpretation typical of visual art gave Rossetti license to subvert established tradition without attracting dangerous attention. Art may have given him plausible deniability, or a platform to express unconscious attitudes which might have been self-censored in a written analysis of *Hamlet*.

#### **Yana Agafonova (EUSP): 'The rise of mass reading and high literature transformation in prerevolutionary Russian society'**

Since the new almost illiterate mass reader was discovered by elites, the history of reading in Russia reveals a dramatic transformation in attitudes to the high literary culture. The new specific addressee provokes a deep self-reflection of elites and reestablishing of communicative strategies between social classes. It was a challenging mission for intelligenzia to determine the communication channel with liberated peasants, so a specific book for common people was elaborated. This type of book could be considered as a historical artifact that remarkably characterizes the reading culture of prerevolutionary Russia and therefore deserves an attentive investigation.

The ways of high culture *appropriation* (Roger Chartier) in the books for common readers could be represented by three major strategies. First of all, classical works of literary art were transformed by picking up fragments related directly to peasants' lives, which could be demonstrated by Pushkin's novel "Eugene Onegin". Another strategy dealt with imposing an explanatory narrator, who makes comments to classical works of art, like in Pushkin's "Poltava". The third strategy represents the reinvention of classical narratives rewritten by those who are socially

close to peasants, which could be demonstrated by the example of Shakespeare's "King Lear" adaptation elaborated by Catherine Katenkamp and entitled "Elder Nikita and his three daughters".

The three cases are analyzed through the way the texts were rewritten, the way they were illustrated and the practice of representing them to people. The analysis demonstrates that the transformation of classical narratives is connected not only with the idea of simplification or ideological domination, but predominantly with self-reflection of elites, reciprocal interaction and an attempt to make horizons of expectations between the reader and the tradition closer to each other. So it could be stated that the enlightening project in prerevolutionary Russia depended on the flexibility of high culture tradition.

**Amy Webster (Cambridge): 'Tea, table manners and... a tiger!: An exploration of how children's literature transforms the traditional English tea time.'**

The taking of tea is regarded as something quintessentially English, a long established practice that dominates our culture and that has a number of traditions and rituals tied to it. In adult culture this taking of tea is presented in a specific way – namely as a very staid, 'flat' event governed by a plethora of rules that those sitting at the tea table must observe. As part of the socializing process children have to be educated about the traditional English tea time and children's literature is one means by which such education occurs. This paper, however, argues that children's literature transforms the taking of tea. Through a study of Judith Kerr's iconic picturebook *The Tiger Who Came To Tea* it explores how the children's author disrupts, re-envisages and energises tea time through investing it with the playfulness of the child. The points raised are discussed with reference to Bakhtin's theory of the Carnival, which focuses on the disruptive energies at play during carnival moments and the liberation that these events provide from the rules of everyday life. Lastly this paper considers the extent to which children's literature transforms tea time. Through drawing a comparison between the ending of *Tiger* and the Mad Hatter's tea party in *Alice in Wonderland* it argues that whilst children's literature does transform the taking of tea for readers, this transformation is just temporary and actually serves to reinforce the traditions of tea time.

**Panel Session 5b): Defining Territories, Establishing Boundaries**

**Benjamin Huf (ANU): 'From *oikos* to the "economic": On the re-invention of economic activities, problems and selves in 19th century British colonization'**

Nothing appears more essential to human life than 'economic activity' – the procuring, allocation and exchanging of limited resources to sustain individuals, families and communities. Humans have, of course, engaged in such practices for well over two millennia, but its conceptualisation as a distinct domain of human affairs dedicated to these ends is no more than two centuries old. The theorising begun by political economists in Britain and France in the early nineteenth century marked a major transformation from the traditional modes of conceiving 'economic activity' – *oikonomia* – as something pertaining to the household, into a set of interlinked, abstract processes they called 'economic phenomena', that was autonomous from politics, nature and ethics. This was more than a theoretical achievement, but a radical demarcation of social space and time in which not only familiar categories – labour, land, capital, exchange, production – were reclassified as 'economic', but necessitated a fundamental transformation in the objects and practices of government.

This paper examines the uses of Ricardian political economy – not as a set of doctrines or arguments but discursive practices and constitutive metaphors – in the governance of early nineteenth-century British colonization, particularly colonial New South Wales, as a means of exploring the governable subjectivities, social relations and intellectual artefacts this transformation constituted. Specifically, the colonizing projects of emigration and land settlement were reconfigured as distinctly 'economic problems'; that is, as problems pertaining to the dynamics of wealth production, distribution and accumulation, raising questions of governance

that had never before been asked. The critical arena of this transformation was not works of theory, but British and colonial select committees where 'public problems' were constructed. These 'problems' and their attendant solutions both greatly accelerated rates of production and consumption over the nineteenth-century and laid the foundations of a distinctly modern tradition that now seems indispensable: 'economics'.

### **Ida Huges Tidlund (Stockholm): 'Transformed borders and traditional meanings in the Åland islands'**

Traditions are commonly perceived as constant and originating from a stable past. So are borders, unless fought over. But what happens with a region's understanding of itself when its territory is transformed due to a continual dislocation of the borders? The Åland islands, autonomous and demilitarised since 1922, offer a rare opportunity to study these issues, as the national process is on-going while the borders float on the surface of the ocean. The territorial borders float in demarcation due to the movement of the ocean, and the cultural borders, understood here as the defining of the region belonging to the imagined community, float in meaning. This floating character of the borders enhances the need of an active interpretation of the past in the community. How is Åland to resist transformation when the borders float, and how do traditional meanings of the borders assist in the anchoring processes of floating borders? A floating territorial border can be fixed in meaning instead of demarcation, which can sharpen it more than political decisions have granted. This is the case with the Eastern border of Åland, known as the Shift, politically defined as a landscape border but commonly interpreted as a cultural border well nigh impossible to cross. The Shift is unfixed as a territorial border, and the discussions meant to fasten it bring out the interpretations of the past of engaged parts. With archive material, I aim to show how different understandings of the past are derived from distinctive political aspirations, all meant to fix the border. Also, by interviewing border crossing individuals, I examine how this culturally sharpened border is experienced in everyday life, to see how borders of different characters interfere with the individuals handling them.

### **Panel Session 5c): The Reconfiguration of Ideas**

#### **Clare Kim (MIT): 'Formalism gets expressive: Mathematics, aesthetics, and the limits of the rational'**

Formalism, abstraction, and rigorous techniques loomed large in the development of mathematics in twentieth-century America. We often think of topology, set theory, and group theory as features of "mathematical modernism" that—especially for mathematicians and historians of mathematics alike—signified the increased professionalization and disciplinary consolidation of mathematics. The same period is also widely acknowledged as a time of dramatic transformation in the arts and architecture. New art forms, techniques of abstraction, and increased functionality in architectural designs characterized a philosophical and artistic movement that came to be called "modernism." Curiously, however, "mathematical modernism" has always been defined as a separate but parallel development. This talk considers "mathematical modernism" as a site at which to investigate the crossing of the artistic and mathematical, the rational and the aesthetic. In particular, I explore mathematician G.D. Birkhoff's engagements with artists and designers over a theory of aesthetic measure, as well as topologist Max Dehn's experiments with mathematical pedagogy at the progressive liberal arts institution of Black Mountain College between 1930 and 1960. Recuperating a broader conception of mathematical practice, this talk reveals the productive interconnectivity between the arts and mathematics. Additionally, it illuminates the possibilities for studying lateral exchanges among disciplines to consider the dynamic between tradition and change.

#### **Christopher Quadt (a.r.t.e.s.): 'Realism and utopia. The transformation of Marxist ideas in the writing of the German author Uwe Timm'**

The German student movement in the late 1960s represents the first big turning-point in the history of the Federal Republic of Germany since it is the first time after 1945 the established political and cultural hegemony is

questioned in a radical way. During that time the participants develop a perception of society as a pyramid of governance: 'on top' the few 'controlling forces', the big groups and owners of capital; 'in the bottom' the workers and students; in between the government with the 'instruments of manipulation' such as schools, universities, media. At first the political fight is directed from 'the bottom' against the mid-level: against professors, police, politics and the media. The goal is to change the awareness of the people and to trace the reasons for this so called 'social manipulation' and 'alienation'. This rethinking affects the way how German literature is recognized, because it is considered as part of the cultural instruments, that are responsible for developing a 'false awareness' in the first place.

The German author Uwe Timm places his writing in Post-1968 into a context of these considerations and doesn't only write three novels in the time between 1973 until 1980 about the student movement (*Heißer Sommer* [1973], *Kerbels Flucht* [1980]) and German colonial history (*Morenga* [1978]). Furthermore, he publishes his thoughts about the political way of writing in a variety of poetological essays during these years, in which he shows how his writing stands in the tradition of Karl Marx's thoughts about 'alienation' and 'reification' as well as how he transforms these ideas in connection to realism as a new way of political literature. In my paper, I will discuss the synergy of traditional Marxist ideas and the transformed concept about realistic and political literature not only in Timm's essays, but also in his novels.

### **Marion Boulicault (MIT): 'A tale of two ideals: An analysis of the value-free ideal(s) of science'**

The value-free ideal holds that, in order to be objective, scientific reasoning must proceed entirely independently of contextual values. In other words, the epistemic authority of science depends on its being independent of social, political and other non-epistemic values. In recent years, a vigorous debate has arisen over whether the existence of 'inductive risk,' i.e. the risk of error in accepting or rejecting a hypothesis, constitutes a sufficient reason to abandon the value-free ideal. In this paper, I argue that this debate suffers from a failure to distinguish between two related, but distinct, ideals of science: the value-free ideal (VFI), which is the view that scientific reasoning should be free of non-epistemic values; and the idiosyncrasy-free ideal (IFI), which is the view that idiosyncratic value judgements should play no role in scientific reasoning. The VFI concerns the appropriate roles that different kinds of values should play in science, and is underpinned by a conception of objectivity as requiring distance from the social world. In contrast, the IFI concerns the appropriate role that personal, idiosyncratic should play in science, and is underpinned by a conception of objectivity as intersubjectivity. I demonstrate that the term 'value-free ideal' is often used to refer to both ideals interchangeably and argue that this equivocation is problematic, since arguments that challenge or support one ideal are not necessarily relevant to the other.

### **Panel Session 6a): Religion and Socio-Political Change**

#### **Eva-Maria Cersovsky (a.r.t.e.s.): 'Traditions in transition. Caring for the sick poor in Reformation Strasbourg'**

During the 16th century, new religious ideas coincided with changes in poor relief in cities all over Europe. While historians initially highlighted the impact of religion as a driving force of transformation, considering Protestant cities to be more ready to break with conventions and develop new relief plans, from the 1960s onwards more emphasis was put on the impact of socio-economic pressures, the role of medieval precedents and the similarities between both Protestant and Catholic endeavours of charity.

Since this year marks the 500th anniversary of the Reformation, the paper revisits the issue, using the city of Strasbourg, which became Protestant during the 1520s, as an example. Based on hospital and civic statutes, sermons, account books as well as diaries written by the hospital's and the alms fund's administrators, the paper focusses on continuities and change in the civic provision of health care, an aspect of poor relief that has received considerably less scholarly attention than the efforts to eliminate begging. I'd like to argue that during the 1520s

to 1550s religious reform interacted with political considerations as well as economic and social factors to give momentum to welfare measures which had already been discussed since the mid-15<sup>th</sup> century and now served to establish the care of the sick as a more constitutive element of poor relief. I will also highlight the simultaneity of tradition and transformation, showing that while new structures of health care were developed, they were at the same time coexisting with and/or followed institutional models that had been set up in previous centuries. This concurrence, I suggest, could lead to very different dynamics: It paved the way for smooth transitions, but also caused conflicts. The case study thus seeks to contribute to our understanding of the complex ways the provision of and motivation for the care of the sick poor developed in the wake of the Reformation.

### **Dimitry Asinovsky (EUSP): 'Religion as a revolutionary ideology. The Soviet perception of the role of religion in national liberation movements in the Third World (1950s-1980s)'**

Lenin once wrote that religion has two sides – traditionalist and progressive, and the manifestation of one or another depends on the historical circumstances. In general the relations between religion and the Soviet ideology are perceived as antagonistic. However when it comes to the Third world in 1950s-1980s and Soviet involvement in the national movements and revolutions this perception turns out to be a point for discussion.

Paradoxically and exactly following Lenin's words in the historical circumstances of struggle of the post-WWII Soviet ideology against colonialism and neocolonialism traditional values including religious ideologies turned out to be its alleged allies in certain countries and regions. Primarily in 1960s-1970s Islam started to transform into a political movement and played significant role in revolutionary movements in Yemen, Iraq, Palestine, Lebanon but first and foremost in Iran. This paper seeks to research how this perceived alliance between the modernist ideology of Marxism-Leninism and traditionalist ideology of political Islam appeared in the heads of Soviet analysts, experts, ideologues, etc.

Although this paper uses the religious revolutionary ideology of Islamic revolution in Iran as its main case study, it also seeks to look deeper in the general perception of traditional values as a vehicle for revolutionary transformation from the point of Soviet ideologues, orientalist and ethnographers, etc.

### **Rodrigo Ochigame (MIT): 'A Genealogy of "Popular Participation" in Brazil'**

"Popular participation" (participação popular) has been a key concept in Brazilian political discourse since the beginnings of redemocratization. In 1985, as soon as the country began to discuss the possibility of a new constitution, mobilizations for popular participation in its elaboration multiplied across the country, collecting over 12 million signatures in support of 122 constitutional amendments. Since then, Brazil has been central to the development of participatory democracy. For example, a series of experiments with participation in the decisions of municipal budgets, most notably in Porto Alegre in 1989, led to the inception of participatory budgeting, now instituted in more than 1,500 cities worldwide. Popular participation has become a distinct tradition within Brazilian politics.

This paper asks how this tradition emerged. Although the term "participation" entered into public discourse only in the 1980s, the ideas and practices of popular participation had been gradually developing since the military regime. I investigate the early manifestations of those ideas and practices. My research is based on interviews with important actors in the first mobilizations for popular participation during redemocratization, as well as their personal archives. Many actors identify particular currents within the Catholic Church, such as liberation theology and Christian democracy, as the origins of the tradition. In their view, the tradition emerged from the experiences of the "basic ecclesial communities" (comunidades eclesiais de base), groups that actively engaged in community organizing in neighborhoods and towns. Other actors identify more secular origins, such as the experiences of neighborhood associations in the urban peripheries. I ask each of those actors how they became involved in the mobilizations, why the idea of popular participation was important to them, and what previous experiences inspired their engagement.

## **Panel Session 6b): Varieties of Linguistic Change**

### **Johan Lundberg (Cambridge): 'Linguistic transformation through the centuries: An examination of Aramaic complement clauses'**

Mesopotamian clay tablets attest to interactions between Aramaic and Assyrian/Babylonia during the first millennium BCE. Aramaic dialects in late antiquity continued this trend being in close contact with e.g. Arabic and Greek. Similarly, Neo-Aramaic dialects sometimes have close ties with e.g. Kurdish. This presentation examines the development of Aramaic complement clauses with this linguistic landscape in mind. The starting point is Old Aramaic (900–700 BCE) moving through Achaemenid Aramaic (700–200 BCE) and Syriac (200–700 CE) to the Modern Neo-Aramaic dialects, with particular focus on North-Eastern Neo-Aramaic. The paper has three foci:

The first is the use of complementizers (*d-* and *l-*) to mark the verb in the complement clause and/or the clause itself.

The second is the use of primary complement taking verbs (e.g. 'to love,' 'to see,' and 'to know') compared to the use of secondary concepts (e.g. 'to begin,' 'to want,' 'to help,' and 'to make'). To the former group belong concepts which are always expressed through lexemes. Secondary concepts, on the other hand, are sometimes realised through grammatical forms (e.g. Aramaic causative prefix *h-/ʾ-*) and sometimes through lexemes. In this examination special emphasis will be on the question of semantic integration of the complement taking verb and the complement clause as well as on intonation group boundaries.

Lastly, the development of these constructions will be considered in light of more general developments of the Aramaic verbal system(s) and how the latter reshape the speaker's toolbox.

### **Chiara Monaco (Cambridge): 'A dangerous relationship: The socio-political impact of the transformation of Greek Language'**

The contrast between tradition and transformation is connatural to the history of Greek, one of the most ancient and influential cultures which, ironically, established its own language incredibly late: the concept of standard modern Greek was officially instituted only in the last decades of the XX century after difficult contrasts between two different systems. The matter was a complicate relationship between the will and the anxiety on preserving the tradition, namely the pure Greek language, and the natural process of transformation which characterized the history of the Greek from the I century AD onwards. This complicate relationship between tradition and innovation ended up producing two different variations of the same language: a type extremely conservative spoken by the well-educated elite, the so-called *katharevousa*, and the language of the lower classes characterized by continuous transformations, known as *demotiki*. Since Greeks were intensely aware of the social function of language differentiations, the contamination of the pure language and the development of different linguistic registers had a massive political and social impact on the society. Over the years, the ability to use the classical language came to be regarded as an exclusive badge of class membership and this perception increased conspicuously during the modern age. In this period under the influence of the European Enlightenment, the language controversy between those who claimed a classicizing written language and those who supported a national language based on the vernacular was personified by Adamantios Korais. He was one of the protagonist of the Greek war of Independence and a controversial personality influenced by the revolutionary and liberal sentiments of the French Revolution but at the same time extremely conservative and elitist in terms of language.

### **Josefina Safar & Maribel Pacheco (Stockholm): 'Yucatec Maya sign language: Sociolinguistic transformations and language evolution'**

In this presentation, we will examine Yucatec Maya Sign Language (YMSL) used in the village of Chicán (Mexico) as an example for the dynamics between tradition and transformation. Due to a high incidence of deafness in this small face-to-face community (17 deaf people among 720 inhabitants), an indigenous sign language emerged over

the course of three generations, which is used by both deaf and hearing villagers. Because YMSL developed independently from institutional settings and without any influence from the national sign language Mexican Sign Language (LSM), it is intricately linked to Yucatec Mayan culture – lifestyle, traditions, occupations, patterns of interaction, rituals and beliefs (Safar, under review). Moreover, there is a tight connection between the local sign language and co-speech gestures used among the hearing population. Yucatec Mayan multimodality influences YMSL on a lexical level (Le Guen, forthcoming) and beyond, e.g. the use of the signing space for verb agreement and person reference (Le Guen & Safar, in prep.), the expression of time (Le Guen 2012) or strategies of noun-verb distinction (Safar, forthcoming).

Today, profound demographic and sociocultural transformations change deaf people's daily lives in Chicán and expand their relationships beyond the community (Pacheco, in prep.). Given the declining birth of deaf children and the increasing dispersion of deaf signers, YMSL is considered a "severely endangered language" according to UNESCO's "Atlas of the World's languages in Danger" (Safar & Webster 2014). We will analyse several of these transforming features – increased mobility, contact with the Mexican Deaf community and with LSM, access to formal education, availability of new technologies and social networks, increased working opportunities in nearby cities – and discuss their impact on the signing community of Chicán as well as on the evolution and vitality of YMSL.

### **Panel Session 6c): Music and Intangible Heritage**

#### **Minjae Zoh (Cambridge): 'Modernising intangible cultural heritage: From outdoor street performance to the indoor technical stage - The case of Pansori, the traditional oral sound of South Korea'**

An oral folklore called *Pansori* that started locally in the streets of the Jeolla region of South Korea during the Joseon Dynasty (commonly agreed to have started around the 18<sup>th</sup> Century) has experienced significant changes in its art form with the turn of every century, i.e. from 'outdoor to indoor,' from 'indoor to stage,' and from 'stage to screen.' Innovations in technology have also meant technological advances for *Pansori* performances – the way it is performed and the way it is presented. With the official inscription of *Pansori* on the Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2008 by the UNESCO Convention, the 'epic chant' has been called the 'sound of Korea' by the South Korean government. However, is the 'sound' that we hear today the 'authentic sound of tradition?' Indeed the folklore has been transformed arguably in many respects – audibly, visually and also in terms of meaning and value. How can this transformation of the tradition be interpreted? Can the acts of 'transforming' be recognised as efforts to preserve and celebrate the tradition or is it a contradiction? Further questions I will address are: can intangible heritage be authentically preserved? It is inevitable that intangible heritage changes according to suit its audience and era?

#### **Florian Homann (a.r.t.e.s.): 'The transformation of traditional flamenco lyrics by contemporary flamenco singers'**

Tradition and transformation are major keywords in the world of Flamenco and especially in the discussions of *Cante Jondo* and *Nuevo Flamenco*. On one hand, *tradition* constitutes a source of knowledge. This term is associated with experiences of the past which should be conserved. On the other hand, *tradition* is also defined as a complex continuous process of transmission, in which the interpretive part of the receiving subject is highly important, transforming and adapting the transmitted object to his/her current circumstances (Dittmann 2004). This dynamic concept of tradition, as the process of transmission and reception of objects and knowledge in specific cultural groups over generations, leads to a discussion whether the term *tradition* should be understood exclusively in the sense of conservation or rather in a sense of *transformation provoked by transmission*.

Using the definition given by Menéndez Pidal (1973), most Flamenco lyrics can be considered *poesía oral tradicional* (oral-traditional poetry). From a historical perspective, this traditional poetry is known to be a dynamic system, in which a single poem has been modified unconsciously by numerous transmitters in oral tradition. This concept has been nuanced by current research on oral literature, emphasizing the conscious textual recreation and innovation in this process.

Bearing in mind the changing dynamics of orality caused by the mediatization of contemporary societies, especially by the impact of new recording technologies on performance (Auslander 2008), the question arises how contemporary flamenco singers work with traditional lyrics. The aim of this contribution is to show in how far a traditional genre can exist between the poles of conservation and transformation by adaption of old traditional Flamenco lyrics to present experiences. This will be shown examining selected examples of Flamenco coplas taken from Fernández Bañuls & Pérez Orozco (2004).

### **Pablo Cuevas (a.r.t.e.s.): ‘Your tradition, my music: Electroacoustic Music from Latin American composers’**

The emergence of *musique concrète* and *elektronische Musik* in the mid-20th Century marked an aesthetic and technical breakpoint in the history of Western academic music. Although the concept of music was expanded to include synthetic and recorded everyday sounds as construction material for musical works, the theoretical reflection on this new music took reference to the past, there was ‘no break with the tradition’, as Pierre Schaeffer stated (1966: 398-399).

The early reception of electroacoustic music in Latin America took different traits. The above-mentioned tension between musical tradition and transformation, that is between the musical canon and the great composers of the past, on the one side, and the liberation of sound potentiated by analogical technology, on the other side, was not necessarily perceived as a burden by many Latin American composers. Transformation was experimentation, whereby playful, critical, and/or ironic approaches seem to be constant, and regional characters arise out of the music with particular force.

This paper aims to reflect on the operating mechanisms for the representation of space in selected electroacoustic works from Latin American composers in the 60s and 70s. Space will be not only acoustically understood, but in its social-historical dimension, as continued by the interaction of real, imagined and real-imagined places (Soja, 1996: 10) evocated by the use of recorded, everyday sounds in the music. It is assumed that the dynamics of transformation that were inherent to electroacoustic music opened new ways for the representation of regional, identity-characters.